On the Syntax of Anti-Distributivity Markers

This talk studies the syntactic properties such items as binominal "each" and the Q-bound reading of "different" and their German counterparts. The paradigms in (1) and (2) illustrate the basic similarity amongst these items: they can only occur attached to indefinites as in (1), and their contribution to interpretation is roughly that of anti-distributivity (Choe 1987)---i.e. they enforce an interpretation where the subject (or some other antecedent) distributes over the phrase they are attached to. In this talk, I try to show that semantic differences amongst these items, explain their syntactic differences.

Proposal: I propose: 1) "different", "unterschiedlich", and "anders" involve comparison of individual. Their syntax involves comparative ACD known from elliptical degree comparatives. 2) German "je" contains a silent copy of its antecedent, and doesn't have a particular relation to its antecedent. It has the syntax of inverse linking constructions. 3) English "each" is semantically very similar to "je", but makes use of a syntactic mechanism similar to ACD to acquire its restrictor from the antecedent.

Different: "Different" and its German counterparts don't need to relate to a quantificational antecedent (Beck 1999), but this Q-bound reading has different properties from discourse bound readings. My new observation in (4a) shows that this Q-bound reading is subject to a locality restriction (an adjunct clause island), the discourse bound reading (4b) isn't. The locality restrictions on Q-bound readings resemble closely those on elliptical comparatives (Bresnan 1975). Such comparatives involve covert wh-movement to resolve antecedent contained ellipsis. I propose that similar covert movement occurs with Q-bound "different". (5) shows a prediction of this idea: a Q-bound reading is only possible, when the host of "different" takes scope outside in the higher clause where its antecedent is found. The German example (6), which utilizes comparative morphology ("than") also is indicative of the comparative nature of "anders". This leads to the proposal in (6), where "different" takes as its internal argument a definite description that's copied (with one modification) from the matrix clause.

JE: Link (1999) notes that "je" in German has far fewer and more lenient restrictions than "each" in English (see below on "each"). I claim that this is related to the fact that also the more complex phrase "je Junge" can function as an adnominal in German (7). The examples in (8) show that "je" need not in a position local to its antecedent, in fact, a syntactically realized antecedent isn't even required at all (8b).

I claim therefore that "je" is a reduced quantificational DP modifying its host DP. Since the universal quantifier "je" needs to take scope outside the host DP, the restriction to indefinites illustrated by (9) follows from facts about QR: Higginbotham & Fiengo (1981) show that definite NPs constitute islands the DPs they contain. I propose therefore the representation in (10) for "je", where "je" itself is interpreted as "every". (10) doesn't directly express a requirement that some boys should've read books different from the others. But, this follows from pragmatic considerations that force "each" omission to obtain such a weaker reading.

Each: Binominal "each" differs from German "je" in two respects: "each" cannot take an overt complement (11b), and "each" must be local to the antecedent (11a). It's tempting to try to relate these two properties. (12) is evidence that, indeed, "each" behaves just like German "je", when the compliment of "each" can be pronounced.

I built upon the proposal of Safir&Stowell (1986) that binominal "each" must move into the vicinity of its antecedent. Further support comes from the observation in (12) (cf. Bruening 1999). Tentatively, I propose (13) where "each" acquires a restriction from the A-bar trace of its antecedent (assuming that A-bar traces contain a copy of the moved restrictor, Fox 1999).
(1)  a. All the boys read a book each.
    b. Alle Jungen haben je ein Buch gelesen.
    c. All the boys read a different book.
    d. Alle Jungen haben ein unterschiedliches/anderes Buch gelesen.

(2)  a. *All the boys read the book each.
    b. *Alle Jungen haben je das Buch gelesen.
    c. *All the boys read the different book.
    d. *Alle Jungen haben das unterschiedliche/andere Buch gelesen.

(3)  a. *every boy x will be content if Mary read a book f(x),
    where f is a one-to-one (bijective) function
    b. every boy x will be content if Mary read a book y ≠ some salient book

(4)  a. For every boy x there's a book different from the books the other boys believe
    Mary read such that he believes that Mary read it.
    b. *Every boy believes that the book he believes Mary read is different from
    the books the other boys think Mary read.

(5)  Jeder Junge hat ein anderes Buch gelesen als die anderen.
    Every boy has a different book read than the others.

(6)  Every boy \( \lambda x \) [different \( [ty \text{ the boy } x \text{ read a book } y] \)]

(7)  a. Alle Jungen haben ein Buch je Junge gelesen.
    b. Ein Buch je Junge gelesen haben alle Jungen.

(8)  a. Die Jungen sind zufrieden, wenn Maria je ein Buch/ein Buch je Junge vorliest.
    b. Der Aufseher ist zufrieden, wenn Maria je ein Buch/ein Buch je Junge vorliest.

(9)  *Die Jungen habe das Buch je Junge gelesen.
    The boys have the book JE boy read

(10) [all the boys] *\( \lambda x \) [every-JE boy] \( \lambda y \). [x read a book(y)]

(11) a. *The boys believe that Mary read one book each.
    b. *The boys read one book each boy.

(12) a. How many books each day did you read?
    b. Last week, you said that Mary read one book each day.

(13) The boys gave a girl one book each. (a girl >> the boys, *the boys >> a girl)

(14) [The boys] *\( \lambda x \) [each] \( \lambda y \lambda y \) [the boy y read a book(y)]

**Selected References**

Link, G. *Algebraic Semantics*. Stanford, CSLI
Zimmermann, M. A different reading each time-on the meaning of German distributive *jeweils*. 